Seeing Double at Memorial University: Two WorldCat Local Usability Studies

Sue Fahey Health Sciences Library
Shannon Gordon Health Sciences Library
Crystal Rose Ferriss Hodgett Library

Presented at the May 2011 Atlantic Provinces Library Association (APLA) Conference in St. John’s, Newfoundland & Labrador
What is WorldCat Local?
WorldCat Local Integration
The Environment

Health Sciences Library
• 2\textsuperscript{nd} largest branch

Ferriss Hodgettt Library
• 3\textsuperscript{rd} largest branch
Literature Review

Arcolio, A., & Poe, F. (2008). *WorldCat Local at the University of California usability testing: Round one, spring 2008 findings and recommendations from the UC-OCLC spring 2008 assessment project (summary report)*.


Our Usability Studies...
Using WorldCat Local for Health Sciences Research: A Usability Study

Sue Fahey & Shannon Gordon, Health Sciences Library, Memorial University
Research questions

1. How well does MUN WCL perform common Health Sciences research tasks?

2. What do study participants think of the MUN WCL interface?
Methodology

- Individual usability sessions
  - Read/signed consent form to indicate agreement to the study’s terms
  - Completed a background questionnaire
  - Used WCL to complete 5 tasks
  - Recorded responses on task sheets & used video capture software
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Search Task</th>
<th>Scenario</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Broad article search</td>
<td>You are working on a research paper for a nursing course and need to find journal articles on this topic: the role of nurses in palliative care.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Known item - text</td>
<td>MUN Libraries owns a copy of the 2010 publication <em>Compendium of Pharmaceuticals and Specialties</em>, and you need to confirm a detail in the book.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Known item - article | You are interested in ethical concerns related to surrogacy. While reading on the topic, you discovered the following article in a bibliography, and wonder if it is available at the library.  
| Known item - reserve | You are taking PHARM4501 and need to look at a book for this course. You know that it is on Reserve at the Health Sciences Library.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Known item - text | You are preparing for your MCCQE (Medical Council of Canada Qualifying Examination) and want to review the thorax. The citations details for the book you need are:  
Broad article search

- High results – 55% satisfied
- 44% used article facet
- Identified key concepts
- Straightforward for 89%

- Challenges
  - “How to get results specifically for journal articles”
  - “Deciding which libraries to search”
  - “Figuring out how to refine search - no 'related articles' to give me ideas (as in Pubmed)”
Known text search

- Straightforward for 55%
- Challenges
  - Confusion with interpreting availability details
  - “Took a while to figure out what to click to get both types of info--which library and call numbers”
  - “Can’t find call numbers!”
  - “Finding the right edition of the resource”

![Bar chart showing that 78% recognized HSL as only location for item, and 22% did not.](chart.png)
Known article search

- Admitted confusion with determining access
- Straightforward for 44%

- Challenges
  - “Trying to see if I could get the document online”
  - “Finding the closest print copies”
  - “Determining local access”
  - “Looking for the print copy”
Reserves search
Reserves search

• Straightforward for 11%
• Searching by reserve code

• Challenges
  – Reserve code discrepancy
  – “I did not know that this option is available and when I found it, it was hidden under an irrelevant title (Memorial University Libraries)”
  – “Defining/indicating that the materials were course reserve/related”

Does WCL provide an option for searching reserves?

- Correct: 33%
- Incorrect: 67%
Known text search

- Straightforward for 100%

- Challenges
  - “Looking for previous editions”
  - “I'm not 100% sure if the book I found was correct.”
Was using WCL to complete this task straightforward?

Task 1 (topic search): 89% Yes, 11% No
Task 2 (CPS): 56% Yes, 44% No
Task 3 (article): 44% Yes, 56% No
Task 4 (reserve): 11% Yes, 89% No
Task 5 (Gray's): 100% Yes, 0% No
Have you ever looked for this kind of information?

- Task 1 (topic search): 33% Yes, 67% No, 11% Unknown
- Task 2 (CPS): 22% Yes, 67% No, 11% Unknown
- Task 3 (known article): 33% Yes, 33% No, 33% Unknown
- Task 4 (reserve): 44% Yes, 56% No, 11% Unknown
- Task 5 (Gray's): 89% Yes, 11% No, 11% Unknown
Observations

• Little use of facets

• Limited ‘Libraries to search’

• Satisfied with high number of results
More observations

• Searched by call # and reserve code
• Recognized main concepts
• Frequently tweaked searches
• Used local Resolver link
Conclusion

1. How well does MUN WCL perform common Health Sciences research tasks?
   Overall, WCL supported these tasks. The exception = reserves.

2. What do study participants think of the MUN WCL interface? Indifferent.
Usability and User Experience of WorldCat Local (WCL) compared to MUN Libraries “Classic” Catalogue (CC): A Study of Undergraduate Students

Crystal Rose, Public Services Librarian, Grenfell
Louise McGillis, AUL, Grenfell
Gillian Byrne, Electronic Resources/Acquisitions Librarian, QEII
Research Questions

• Would there be a difference in the success rates of students using WCL compared to CC? Would students completing tasks in WCL have a higher success rate?
• Were there types of searches that would have a higher or lower success rate depending on the catalogue used?
• What do students think about WCL?
• Secondary objective – Did receiving prior library instruction have a positive correlation with students’ success performing search tasks?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Search Task</th>
<th>Question</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Access an online journal</td>
<td>1a. Do a search for the “Journal of Adolescent Health”. Is this journal available online?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locate print journal</td>
<td>1b. Is this journal available in print at Grenfell?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author Search: Locate a book by author, and locate call number</td>
<td>3a. Do a search for books by the author Sandra Birdsell. Write down the title and call number of a book by this author:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location information of an item</td>
<td>3b. Is this book available at Grenfell?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject Search: Locate a book by topic</td>
<td>4a. Do a search on the topic “global warming”. Write down the following information about a book on that topic:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location information of an item</td>
<td>4b. Is this book available at Grenfell?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Previous Experience

- Used CC instruction: 71%
- Used instruction CC: 68%
- Used WCL: 42%
- Used instruction WCL: 42%
- Used neither: 17%
### Participant Success Rate (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>MEAN</th>
<th>MEDIAN</th>
<th>MODE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WCL</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CC</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>86%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*based on number of tasks completed successfully*
1b. Is this journal available in print at Grenfell?
3a. Author search: What is the title & call number?

- Correct: 100%
- Incorrect: 24%
Question 1b Cross-Tabulation

CC Users

WCL Users
Question 3a Cross-Tabulation

CC Users

WCL Users
Post-Test Questionnaire

For 5 out of the 8 statements, majority of both the WCL and the CC users strongly agreed:

- “It was easy to find a book (print or electronic) in the Grenfell library”
- “The information I got from the catalogue was relevant”
- “I was able to navigate through the screens easily”
- “The information was presented in a readable format”
- “The information was presented in an uncluttered format”
3a. What is the title & call number?

- **Correct**
  - CC: 90
  - WCL: 80

- **Incorrect**
  - CC: 0
  - WCL: 20

It was easy to find the call number for a book

- **Strongly agree**
  - CC: 90
  - WCL: 80
What did you like **MOST** about the library catalogue?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WCL</th>
<th>CC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“easy” (47%), “clear” (12%), “not confusing”, “simplicity”</td>
<td>“easy” (72%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>most “relevant” results displayed first (12%)</td>
<td>particularly in terms of narrowing your search by library (43%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>positive comments about layout (47%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WCL</td>
<td>CC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“nothing” (29%)</td>
<td>“nothing” (43%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>difficulty narrowing searches or limiting results</td>
<td>way search results displayed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>difficulty determining if an item was at the student’s branch</td>
<td>finding an item’s details</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>difficulty determining if a journal is accessible online</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONCLUSIONS

• Is there a difference in the success rates of students using WCL compared to CC? **NO**
• Did students completing tasks in WCL have a higher success rate? **NO**
• Were there types of searches that would have a higher or lower success rate depending on the catalogue used? **NO**
CONCLUSIONS

• What do students think about WCL? **No strong preference for one over the other, comments and feedback about both generally positive**

• Did receiving prior library instruction have a positive correlation with students’ success performing search tasks? **Inconclusive**
CONCLUSIONS

• Users in both CC and WCL had similar difficulty determining print holdings for a journal, suggesting that existing difficulties with CC may not necessarily be solved by WCL

• WCL users had some difficulty identifying and distinguishing between different types of resources (e.g. book, article, journal)

• WCL users had more difficulty locating an item’s call number than CC users
Comparisons with other studies

• Oregon State University Libraries (Boock, Chadwell, & Reese, 2009)
• Western Washington University Libraries (Thomas & Buck, 2010)
• MUN Libraries Health Sciences Library!
HSL & FHL Similarities

• challenges identifying the location for a specific text in WCL
• some difficulty locating call numbers in WCL
• more difficulty determining print availability of a journal compared to online in WCL
• challenges recognizing different types of resources in WCL (e.g. book, article, journal)
• difficulty consistently interpreting citation information
• no clear preference for WCL over CC